Roth vs Traditional IRA: Which One is Right for You?

Avery Hayes

When planning for retirement, choosing between a **Roth IRA** and a **Traditional IRA** can significantly affect your long-term wealth. Both accounts offer tax advantages, but how—and when—you get those benefits differs. The right choice depends on your **current tax bracket, your expected future income**, and your plan for managing taxes in retirement.

Let's break down the differences and help you decide which one makes the most sense for your financial future.

---

1. Tax Treatment: Pay Now or Pay Later?

The core difference between Roth and Traditional IRAs is in their tax treatment:

- Traditional IRA: Contributions may be tax-deductible now, reducing your current taxable income. However, withdrawals in retirement are taxed as ordinary income.
- Roth IRA: Contributions are made with after-tax dollars. You don't get a tax break now, but qualified withdrawals in retirement are entirely tax-free.

🔍 **So, which is better?**

- Choose a Roth IRA if you're in a low tax bracket today and expect higher income (or higher tax rates) in the future.
- Choose a Traditional IRA if you're in a high tax bracket today and expect to be in a lower bracket in retirement.

💡 But what if you're in a middle tax bracket today (like 22% or 24%) and expect to stay in that range during retirement, as many people do? In that case, the better choice depends on how you view future tax rates:

- If you believe tax rates will increase, the Roth IRA offers protection—your taxes are paid now, and your retirement income will be tax-free regardless of how high rates climb.

- If you think tax rates will remain the same or decrease, a Traditional IRA might give you more value by lowering your taxable income today.

👉 This decision requires thoughtful tax planning and a forward-looking strategy.

💡 **Bonus:** A **Roth IRA also acts as a hedge against rising tax rates**. Since you've already paid taxes on your contributions, your future withdrawals—both contributions and earnings—are shielded from future tax increases.

---

2. Investment Options: Both IRAs Offer the Same Choices

Contrary to popular belief, you can invest in the same assets within both Roth and Traditional IRAs.

🔁 Both account types can hold:

- Stocks
- Bonds
- Mutual funds
- ETFs
- REITs
- CDs and more

So, your investment strategy doesn't need to change based on which IRA you choose. The difference lies in the tax treatment, not the investment options.

---

3. Roth IRA Has Liquidity Advantages

A Roth IRA offers a unique benefit: your original contributions (your principal) are always accessible—tax- and penalty-free—from day one.

This makes Roth IRAs more flexible than Traditional IRAs, which generally penalize all early withdrawals.

However, two key rules apply to earnings in a Roth IRA:

🔹 **The 59½ Rule**

You must be at least age 59½ to withdraw earnings without penalty. If you withdraw earnings before this age, they are typically subject to both income tax and a 10% penalty, unless an exception applies (such as a first-time home purchase or qualified education expenses).

🔹 **The 5-Year Rule**

Even if you're over 59½, your Roth IRA must be open for at least 5 years to withdraw earnings tax-free.

💡 If you're under 59½, even if the 5-year rule is met, earnings are still likely to be taxed and penalized—unless the withdrawal meets an IRS-approved exception.

👉 **Bottom line:** To withdraw earnings tax- and penalty-free, you must meet both the 59½ rule and the 5-year rule. But your contributions are always penalty- and tax-free.

Which IRA Is Right for You?

Here's a simple guide:

Scenario	**Better Option**
You're early in your career, income will grow	Roth IRA
You're at peak earnings, expecting lower retirement income	Traditional IRA
You want tax-free income later and a hedge against future tax hikes	Roth IRA
You want a tax deduction today	Traditional IRA
You need potential access to contributions before retirement	Roth IRA
You're uncertain about the future	Consider using both

Final Thoughts

Both Roth and Traditional IRAs are powerful tools to help you grow retirement savings. The best choice comes down to **your current vs. future tax situation**, as well as your need for flexibility.

For many people, a mix of both types can offer the best of both worlds: immediate tax benefits and long-term tax-free income.

But choosing and balancing these accounts effectively requires more than guesswork—it takes a detailed, personalized strategy to ensure you're contributing the right amounts, in the right way, at the right time. Factoring in income levels, tax bracket shifts, investment growth, and withdrawal sequencing is key to getting the most out of your retirement plan.

AVERY HAYES

Financial Strategist, Investment Advisor Representative

Avery Hayes is a dedicated Financial Advisor at Hayes Advisory Group with a focus on strategic planning and education. With a passion for helping clients navigate the complexities of financial management, Avery specializes in creating and implementing comprehensive plans that encompass investment management, financial planning, and tax planning. Avery's approach is rooted in a deep understanding of the financial landscape and a commitment to educating clients, empowering them to make informed decisions about their financial future. Avery also helps with educational courses taught through employer classes, classes taught for Federal employees, and The Prepare Institute, a 501©3 non-profit educational institution.

765.452.7526 | Avery@hayesadvisorygroup.com | hayesadvisorygroup.com